

New Jersey Schools Insurance Group 6000 Midlantic Drive, Suite 300 North Mount Laurel, New Jersey 08054 (609) 386-6060 • FAX (609) 386-8877 www.njsig.org

Board of Trustees Meeting of March 15, 2017 Action Item Outside Counsel RFQ

As a part of NJSIG's efforts to maintain compliance with the PSCL, NJSIG issued requests for qualifications for outside counsel for General Litigation, Complex General Litigation, School / Education Litigation, Workers' Compensation Litigation, and Complex Workers' Compensation Litigation. As a result of this competitive contracting process, NJSIG received numerous proposals from qualified firms. These proposals were evaluated using the weighted evaluation criteria, and the results of that evaluation are attached.

The designation of a firm as approved outside counsel is not a retention for a specific matter, and does not entitle a firm to be retained for a specific matter. Rather, these firms would now be eligible to handle matters on behalf of NJSIG insureds. Individual case assignments will be determined by the Chief Legal Officer and the Claims Manager based on the unique requirements of each matter. The cutoff for qualifying for the outside counsel designation was an average score of seventy-five or greater. Thus, it is proposed that the firms identified the attached resolution be designated as outside counsel in the respective areas.

Recommended Resolution: to approve the firms identified the attached resolution be designated as outside counsel in the respective areas.

William Mayo

William Mayo, CPCU, ARM Executive Director



WHEREAS, the New Jersey Schools Insurance Group ("NJSIG") is authorized by <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 18A:18B-1, <u>et seq.</u> to provide insurance coverage for its members;

WHEREAS, NJSIG requires professional services in the form of outside counsel to represent the interests of NJSIG's insured in claims;

WHEREAS, NJSIG has engaged in a fair and open competitive contracting process, pursuant to which proposals were solicited; and,

WHEREAS, an evaluation committee was convened by NJSIG and has evaluated all proposals submitted.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, on this 15th day of March, 2017 that:

- NJSIG designates the following firms as Outside Counsel as to each respective area based on technical criteria, management criteria, cost criteria and the service provider's demonstrated service to public entities in the State of New Jersey:
 - a. General Litigation (C-2017-0001):
 - i. Capehart Scatchard;



- ii. DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin;
- iii. Diego F. Navas;
- iv. DiFrancesco Bateman;
- v. Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader;
- vi. Kent McBride;
- vii. La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella;
- viii. Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey;
 - ix. Methfessel & Werbel;
 - x. Nirenberg & Varano;
 - xi. Pashman Stein Walder Hayden;
- xii. Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti;
- xiii. Scarinci Hollenbeck; and,
- xiv. Stephen E. Gertler.
- b. Complex General Litigation (C-2017-0002):
 - i. Capehart Scatchard;
 - ii. Cleary Giacobbe Alfieri Jacobs;
 - iii. DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin;



- iv. DiFrancesco Bateman;
- v. Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader;
- vi. Kent McBride;
- vii. La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella;
- viii. Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey;
 - ix. Methfessel & Werbel;
 - x. Nirenberg & Varano;
 - xi. Pashman Stein Walder Hayden;
- xii. Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti; and,
- xiii. Scarinci Hollenbeck.
- c. School / Education Litigation (C-2017-0003):
 - i. Capehart Scatchard;
 - ii. DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin;
 - iii. DiFrancesco Bateman;
 - iv. Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader;
 - v. Kent McBride;
 - vi. La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella;



- vii. Methfessel & Werbel;
- viii. Nirenberg & Varano;
- ix. Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan;
- x. Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti; and,
- xi. Scarinci Hollenbeck.
- d. General Workers' Compensation Litigation (C-2017-0004):
 - i. Biancamano & DiStefano;
 - ii. Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof;
 - iii. Brown & Connery;
 - iv. Kent McBride;
 - v. Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause; and,
 - vi. Stephen E. Gertler.
- e. Complex Workers' Compensation Litigation (C-2017-0005):
 - i. Biancamano & DiStefano;
 - ii. Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof;
 - iii. Brown & Connery;
 - iv. Capehart Scatchard;



- v. Kent McBride; and,
- vi. Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause.
- 2) The Executive Director is hereby authorized to execute professional services agreements with the above-referenced service providers;
- 3) The Chief Legal Officer, with the advice of the Claims Manager, is hereby authorized to retain firms designated as Outside Counsel that have executed a professional service agreement as to each respective area to represent NJSIG insureds in specific matters in accordance with NJSIG Policy 2212;
- This designation is in accordance with the Public School Contracts Law, <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 18A:18A-1, <u>et seq.</u>;
- 5) A notice of this action shall be published once in the official newspaper designated by NJSIG, and is on file and available for public inspection at the office of NJSIG.

I certify that the foregoing is a true copy of a Resolution passed by the New Jersey Schools Insurance Group at the meeting duly held on the 15th day of March, 2017.



New Jersey Schools Insurance Group

By:

Irene Le Febvre, Chairperson

Board Secretary Use Only

DATE:

MOVED BY:

SECONDED BY:

VOTE:

Capehant Serichtad90.666666790.666666790.666666790.666666690.666666790.9090.9090.90Rater Madder Flayden88.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.333333388.33333388.33333388.333333388.33333388.33333388.33333388.666666799.90<	Firm Name	Average	Γ
	Capehart Scatchard	90.6666667	
	Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	60	
	Kent McBride	89.3333333	
	Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	88.3333333	
	Diego F. Navas	88	
	DiFrancesco Bateman	87	
	DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	86.66666667	
	Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	86	
	La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	80	
	Methfessel & Werbel	78.3333333	
	Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	76	
	Nirenberg & Varano	75	
	Stephen E. Gertler	75	
	Scarinci Hollenbeck	75	
	Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	74.3333333	Γ
	Brown & Connery	72.3333333	T

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

1 of 8

XIAM Results

I
00
C-2017-0001
-
H
20
10
0
1
đ
19.
at
ä
al
E
N
U.
2
H-4
1
H
5
Ĕ
G
e
2
at
Ξ.
n
č
Ë.
S
0
2
5
Ś
\mathbf{b}
e
LS
e
New Jersey Schools Insurance Group - RFQ Evaluation - C-2017-0
A
7
4

Firm Name	Average
Stahl & DeLaurentis	71.66666667
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	71
Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	68
Biancamano & DiStefano	66.3333333
Patker McCay	66
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	63.3333333
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	59
Florio Kenny Raval	28
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	54
Costigan & Costigan	54
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	39.6666667

Results

Total	74	53	40	65	66	06	51	83	90	84	59	57	84	90
Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	30	20	10	20	30	35	15	30	36	30	15	15	35	33
Cost Criteria (20)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
Management Criteria (20)	12	œ	Ŋ	12	æ	17	œ	15	16	16	12	12	16	19
Technical Criteria (20)	12	ũ	5	13	80	18	œ	18	18	18	12	10	13	18
Firm Name	Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	Bauch Zucker Hatfield	Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Biancamano & DiStefano	Brown & Connery	Capehart Scatchard	Costigan & Costigan	DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	Diego F. Navas	DiFrancesco Bateman	Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	Florio Kenny Raval	Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	Kent McBride

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

3 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

2

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	15	20	30	80
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	18	18	20	38	94
Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	13	14	20	25	72
Methfessel & Werbel	10	15	20	35	80
Nirenberg & Varano	10	10	20	35	75
Parker McCay	8	5	10	40	63
Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	18	17	20	35	90
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	5	5	20	30	60
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	16	16	20	35	87
Scarinci Hollenbeck	18	18	0	35	71
Stahl & DeLaurentis	17	18	20	15	70
Stephen E. Gertler	10	18	20	32	80
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	6	6	20	30	62

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri 🖉

4 of 8

Total	75	56	41	65	76	90	51	89	89	89	59	57	88	89
Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	30	20	10	20	30	35	15	35	37	35	15	15	35	35
Cost Criteria (20)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
Management Criteria (20)	13	œ	6	12	15	17	8	16	15	16	12	12	16	16
Technical Criteria (20)	12	æ	Ŋ	13	11	18	ø	18	17	18	12	10	17	18
Firm Name	Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	Bauch Zucker Hatfield	Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Biancamano & DiStefano	Brown & Connery	Capehart Scatchard	Costigan & Costigan	DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	Diego F. Navas	DiFrancesco Bateman	Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	Florio Kenny Raval	Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	Kent McBride

Evaluation Completed hv: Deitrch (M

5 of 8

					1							1	
Total	80	74	72	75	75	71	91	60	89	84	70	71	76
Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	30	30	25	35	35	35	35	30	37	40	15	35	35
Cost Criteria (20)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	12	20	20	20
Management Criteria (20)	15	12	14	10	10	8	18	Ŋ	16	16	18	œ	10
Technical Criteria (20)	15	12	13	10	10	8	18	ĩ	16	16	17	80	11
Firm Name	La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	Methfessel & Werbel	Nirenberg & Varano	Parker McCay	Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	Scarinci Hollenbeck	Stahl & DeLaurentis	Stephen E. Gertler	Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas

Evaluation Completed by: Deitch

6 of 8

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	12	12	20	30	74
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	ſ	œ	20	20	53
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	ŝ	S	20	10	38
Biancamano & DiStefano	12	12	20	25	69
Brown & Connery	10	15	20	30	75
Capehart Scatchard	20	17	20	35	92
Costigan & Costigan	10	10	20	20	60
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	15	20	35	88
Diego F. Navas	15	15	20	35	85
DiFrancesco Bateman	18	15	20	35	88
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	12	12	20	15	59
Florio Kenny Raval	10	10	20	20	60
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	15	16	20	35	86
Kent McBride	18	16	20	35	89

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

7 of 8

Evaluation Completed hv: Marek 1100

raluation - C-2017-0001
Eva
RFQ
nce Group
sey Schools Insurance Group -
ersey School

Total	80	60	60	80	75	64	89	70	89	70	75	74	75
Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	30	20	20	35	35	35	35	30	35	30	20	30	35
Cost Criteria (20)	20	20	20	20	20	10	20	20	20	10	20	20	20
Management Criteria (20)	15	10	10	15	10	10	17	10	17	15	18	12	10
Technical Criteria (20)	15	10	10	10	10	6	17	10	17	15	17	12	10
Firm Name	La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	Methfessel & Werbel	Nirenberg & Varano	Parker McCay	Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	Scarinci Hollenbeck	Stahl & DeLaurentis	Stephen E. Gertler	Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

8 of 8

Evaluation Completed hv: Marek

1/n/n

Firm Name	Average	
Kent McBride	89.33333333	
Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	88.6666667	1
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	88.3333333	-
DiFrancesco Bateman	87.3333333	-
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	86.6666667	1
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	86.6666667	1
Scarinci Hollenbeck	86.6666667	1
Capehart Scatchard	85	
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	81	1
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	80	1
Cleary Giacobbe Alfieri Jacobs	78.6666667	-
Methfessel & Werbel	78.3333333	-
Nirenberg & Varano	75	1
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	73	
Brown & Connery	72.3333333	
Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	72	
		1

1 of 8



A1
24
0
0
ō
Y
N
-
-
\mathbf{z}
CI.
1
\mathbf{O}
-
-
H.
0
•
1
0
i et l
5
-5
LT.
~
-
LT.
-
-
1
5
5
2
12
0
-
0
0
×
E .
5
- H
-
1
S
9
5
0
0
a
-
Q
S
CO.
in
-
CD I
-
0
4
· ·
New Jersey Schools Insurance Group - RFQ Evaluation - C-2017-0002

Firm Name	Average		
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	71.66666667		
Stephen E. Gertler	71.66666667		
Stahl & DeLaurentis	70		
Parker McCay	69.33333333		
Biancamano & DiStefano	63.33333333		
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	60		
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	59		
Florio Kenny Raval	57		
Costigan & Costigan	56		
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	53		
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	39.66666667		

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	5	Ŋ	20	30	60
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	5	ø	20	20	53
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Ŋ	Ŋ	20	10	40
Biancamano & DiStefano	13	12	20	20	65
Brown & Connery	ø	æ	20	30	66
Capehart Scatchard	15	15	20	30	80
Cleary Giacobbe Alfieri Jacobs	9	9	20	25	57
Costigan & Costigan	8	ø	20	15	51
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	15	20	30	83
DiFrancesco Bateman	18	16	20	30	84
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	12	12	20	15	59
Florio Kenny Raval	10	12	20	15	57
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	13	16	20	35	84
Kent McBride	18	19	20	33	90

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

3 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	15	20	30	80
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	18	18	20	38	94
Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	13	14	20	25	72
Methfessel & Werbel	10	15	20	35	80
Nirenberg & Varano	10	10	20	35	75
Parker McCay	8	5	20	40	73
Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	18	17	20	35	06
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	5	5	20	30	60
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	16	16	20	35	87
Scarinci Hollenbeck	18	18	20	35	91
Stahl & DeLaurentis	17	18	20	15	70
Stephen E. Gertler	10	18	20	32	80
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	œ	œ	20	35	71

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

4 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	12	13	20	30	75
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	ø	8	20	20	56
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	5	Q	20	10	41
Biancamano & DiStefano	13	12	20	20	65
Brown & Connery	11	15	20	30	76
Capehart Scatchard	18	17	20	35	06
Cleary Giacobbe Alfieri Jacobs	15	16	20	37	88
Costigan & Costigan	8	ø	20	15	51
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	16	20	35	89
DiFrancesco Bateman	18	16	20	35	89
Erric M. Bernstein & Associates	12	12	20	15	59
Florio Kenny Raval	10	12	20	15	57
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	17	16	20	35	88
Kent McBride	18	16	20	35	89

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

5 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Deitch

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	15	20	30	80
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	12	12	20	30	74
Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	13	14	20	25	72
Methfessel & Werbel	10	10	20	35	75
Nirenberg & Varano	10	10	20	35	75
Parker McCay	8	8	20	35	71
Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	18	18	20	35	91
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	ъ	5	20	30	60
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	16	16	20	37	89
Scarinci Hollenbeck	16	16	20	35	87
Stahl & DeLaurentis	17	18	20	15	70
Stephen E. Gertler	5	S	20	35	65
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	6	6	20	35	73

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Deitch (\mathcal{N})

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	20	10	20	30	80
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	2	5	20	20	50
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	3	ŝ	20	10	38
Biancamano & DiStefano	10	10	20	20	60
Brown & Connery	10	15	20	30	75
Capehart Scatchard	18	17	20	30	85
Cleary Giacobbe Alfieri Jacobs	18	18	20	35	91
Costigan & Costigan	8	8	20	30	66
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	15	20	35	88
DiFrancesco Bateman	18	16	20	35	89
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	12	12	20	15	59
Florio Kenny Raval	10	12	20	15	57
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	17	16	20	35	88
Kent McBride	18	16	20	35	89

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

7 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Mitzelman

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	15	20	30	80
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	10	15	20	30	75
Malapero Prisco Klauber & Licata	13	14	20	25	72
Methfessel & Werbel	10	15	20	35	80
Nirenberg & Varano	10	10	20	35	75
Parker McCay	6	8	12	35	64
Pashman Stein Walder Hayden	15	15	20	35	85
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	5	5	20	30	60
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	17	17	20	35	89
Scarinci Hollenbeck	16	16	20	30	82
Stahl & DeLaurentis	17	18	20	15	70
Stephen E. Gertler	ø	12	20	30	70
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	10	10	20	35	75

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Mitzelman

Firm Name	Average	
Kent McBride	90.33333333	
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	87.33333333	
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	87	
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	85.66666667	
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	85	
DiFrancesco Bateman	84.33333333	
Methfessel & Werbel	80	
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	79.6666667	
Capehart Scatchard	78.3333333	
Nirenberg & Varano	76.3333333	
Scarinci Hollenbeck	76.3333333	
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	74.3333333	
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	72.66666667	
Brown & Connery	71.3333333	
Stephen E. Gertler	70	
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	67	

1 of 8

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	12	12	20	30	74
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	Ŋ	œ	20	20	53
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Ŋ	Ŋ	20	10	40
Brown & Connery	œ	Ŋ	20	30	63
Capehart Scatchard	10	10	20	30	70
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	15	20	30	83
DiFrancesco Bateman	18	16	20	30	84
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	12	12	20	15	59
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	13	16	20	35	84
Kent McBride	18	18	20	35	91
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	15	20	30	80
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	12	12	20	30	74
Nirenberg & Varano	10	10	20	35	75
Parker McCay	œ	5	10	40	63

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

3 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

Film Name Cr	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Management Cost Criteria Criteria (20) (20)	in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	16	16	20	35	87
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	16	16	20	35	87
Scarinci Hollenbeck	18	18	0	35	71
Stephen E. Gertler	10	10	20	40	80
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	æ	8	20	35	71
Methfessel & Werbel	10	15	20	35	80

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	12	13	20	30	75
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	8	8	20	20	56
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	5	9	20	10	41
Brown & Connery	11	15	20	30	76
Capehart Scatchard	10	10	20	35	75
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	16	20	35	89
DiFrancesco Bateman	18	16	20	35	89
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	12	12	20	15	59
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	17	16	20	35	80
Kent McBride	18	16	20	35	89
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	15	20	30	80
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	10	10	20	30	70
Nirenberg & Varano	10	10	20	35	75
Parker McCay	ø	8	15	35	66

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

5 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Deitch

	I echnical Criteria (20)	Management Cost Criteria Criteria (20) (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	16	16	20	35	87
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	16	16	20	37	89
Scarinci Hollenbeck	16	16	12	35	62
Stephen E. Gertler	Ŀ	Ŋ	20	35	65
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	6	6	20	35	73
Methfessel & Werbel	10	10	20	35	75

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

6 of 8

Evaluation Completed by: Deitch

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Adams Gutierrez & Lattiboudere	12	12	20	30	74
Bauch Zucker Hatfield	S	8	20	20	53
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	4	4	20	15	43
Brown & Connery	10	15	20	30	75
Capehart Scatchard	18	17	20	35	06
DeCotiis FitzPatrick Cole & Giblin	18	15	20	30	83
DiFrancesco Bateman	16	14	20	30	80
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	10	12	20	15	57
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	18	17	20	35	06
Kent McBride	18	18	20	35	91
La Corte Bundy Varady & Kinsella	15	14	20	30	79
Lenox Socey Formidoni Giordano Cooley Lang & Casey	11	11	20	15	57
Nirenberg & Varano	12	12	20	35	79
Parker McCay	ø	ø	15	15	46

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Purcell Mulcahy Hawkins & Flanagan	16	16	20	35	87
Riker Danzig Scherer Hyland Perretti	16	15	20	30	81
Scarinci Hollenbeck	18	16	10	35	62
Stephen E. Gertler	5	Ю	20	35	65
Wolff Helies Spaeth & Lucas	6	10	20	35	74
Methfessel & Werbel	15	15	20	35	85

Evaluation Completed by: Huntley \mathbb{R}^{M}

C-2017-0004
New Jersey Schools Insurance Group - RFQ Evaluation - C-2017-0004
roup - RFQ
s Insurance G
ersey Schools
New J

Brown & Connery96.6666666Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof92.3333333Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof92.3333333Kent McBride89Kent McBride89Biancamano & DiStefano87Biancamano & DiStefano87Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause76.66666667Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause75.66666667Stephen E. Gertler75Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg70Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader67.66666667	
Florio Kenny Raval 63	
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates 58	
Stahl & DeLaurentis 57.33333333	

Total	65	85	85	90	50	60	54	89	77	45	73
Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	20	30	35	35	10	20	20	30	28	10	25
Cost Criteria (20)	20	20	10	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
Management Criteria (20)	10	15	20	15	10	10	9	20	12	IJ	12
Technical Criteria (20)	15	20	20	20	10	10	00	19	17	10	16
Firm Name	Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Biancamano & DiStefano	Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof	Brown & Connery	Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	Florio Kenny Raval	Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	Kent McBride	Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause	Stahl & DeLaurentis	Stephen E. Gertler

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

Total	75	90	100	100	50	60	69	89	84	45	73
Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	30	30	40	40	10	20	25	30	35	10	25
Cost Criteria (20)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
Management Criteria (20)	10	20	20	20	10	10	9	20	12	ũ	12
Technical Criteria (20)	15	20	20	20	10	10	18	19	17	10	16
Firm Name	Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Biancamano & DiStefano	Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof	Brown & Connery	Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	Florio Kenny Raval	Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	Kent McBride	Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause	Stahl & DeLaurentis	Stephen E. Gertler

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Olsen

Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	Criteria (20)	Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
0	10	10	20	30	70
Biancamano & DiStefano	19	17	20	30	86
Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof	20	17	20	35	92
Brown & Connery	20	20	20	40	100
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	17	17	20	20	74
Florio Kenny Raval	18	9	20	25	69
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	18	19	20	23	80
Kent McBride	19	20	20	30	89
Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause	17	12	20	20	69
Stahl & DeLaurentis	18	17	20	27	82
Stephen E. Gertler	16	18	20	25	62

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Rogers

C-2017-0005
New Jersey Schools Insurance Group - RFQ Evaluation - C-2017-0005
- RFQ
e Group
Insurance
y Schools
New Jerse

		98 95 95 95 93.3333333 88 88 88 88 88 3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 88.3333333 90 64 60 60	Capehart Scatchard Brown & Connery Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof Kent McBride Kent McBride Biancamano & DiStefano Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause Stephen E. Gertler Stephen E. Gertler Stephen E. Gertler Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader Florio Kenny Raval Florio Kenny Raval
ciates		45	Stahl & DeLaurentis
		66	scarinci Hollenbeck
		68.33333333	ett Bricklin & Saltzburg
		73	Stephen E. Gertler
		80	r Tort DeFazio & Brause
		88.33333333	ncamano & DiStefano
		89	Kent McBride
		93.3333333	larris Sukoneck & Maloof
		95	Brown & Connery
		98	Capehart Scatchard
		Average	Firm Name

Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	5	10	20	20	55
Biancamano & DiStefano	20	15	20	30	85
Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof	20	20	10	35	85
Brown & Connery	20	15	20	35	90
Capehart Scatchard	15	20	20	40	95
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	10	10	20	10	50
Florio Kenny Raval	10	10	20	20	60
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	8	9	20	20	54
Kent McBride	19	20	20	30	89
Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause	17	12	20	28	77
Scarinci Hollenbeck	10	15	IJ	30	60
Stahl & DeLaurentis	10	Ω	20	10	45
Stephen E. Gertler	16	12	20	25	73

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Ruggeri

Benet Bricklin & Saltzburg 15 10 20 <th< th=""><th>Firm Name</th><th>Technical Criteria (20)</th><th>Management Criteria (20)</th><th>Cost Criteria (20)</th><th>Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)</th><th>Total</th><th></th></th<>	Firm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total	
20 20 20 30 30 20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 20 40 40 10 10 20 20 40 40 110 10 20	Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	15	10	20	30	75	-
20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 40 40 20 20 20 20 40 10 10 20 20 20 20 110 10 20 20 20 20 20 113 6 20 20 25 20 20 20 117 112 20 20 30 30 20	Biancamano & DiStefano	20	20	20	30	90	1
20 20 20 40 20 20 20 40 10 10 20 20 40 10 10 20 20 40 7 10 10 20 20 20 7 7 10 10 20 20 20 20 7 7 11 12 20 20 30 30 7 7 11 12 20 20 30 30 7 7 11 12 20 20 30 30 7 7 10 15 5 30 35 7 7 7 10 15 5 30 30 7	Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof	20	20	20	40	100	
20 20 20 40 40 10 10 20 10 10 10 10 10 20 20 20 20 20 18 6 20 20 20 20 20 20 19 20 20 20 30 30 20	Brown & Connery	20	20	20	40	100	1
ciates10102010c Fader10102020c Fader1862020c Fader1862025c Fader19202030rause17122035rause1015530rause1052010f1052010f16122025	Capehart Scatchard	20	20	20	40	100	
10 10 20 20 20 18 6 20 25 25 19 20 20 30 30 17 12 20 30 35 10 15 5 30 35 10 15 5 30 36 10 15 5 30 36 10 15 5 30 36 10 15 5 30 36 10 15 5 30 36 10 10 5 30 36 10 5 20 10 36 16 12 20 26 26 26 27	Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	10	10	20	10	50	
18 6 20 25 25 19 20 20 30 30 17 12 20 30 35 10 15 5 30 30 10 15 5 30 30 10 15 5 30 30 10 15 5 30 30 16 12 20 10 10 10 16 12 20 20 10	Florio Kenny Raval	10	10	20	20	60	
19 20 20 30 17 12 20 35 10 15 5 30 10 5 50 30 10 5 20 10 10 5 20 10 16 12 20 10 16 12 20 10	orio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	18	9	20	25	69	
17 12 20 35 10 15 5 30 10 5 20 10 10 5 20 10 16 12 20 10 16 12 20 25	Kent McBride	19	20	20	30	89	1
10 15 5 30 10 5 20 10 16 12 20 25	ceitner Tort DeFazio & Brause	17	12	20	35	84	1
10 5 20 10 16 12 20 25	Scarinci Hollenbeck	10	15	'n	30	60	
16 12 20 25	Stahl & DeLaurentis	10	S	20	10	45	
	Stephen E. Gertler	16	12	20	25	73	

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Olsen 100

Fitm Name	Technical Criteria (20)	Management Criteria (20)	Cost Criteria (20)	Service to Public Entities in the State of New Jersey (40)	Total
Bennett Bricklin & Saltzburg	15	10	20	30	75
Biancamano & DiStefano	20	20	20	30	90
Braff Harris Sukoneck & Maloof	20	20	20	35	95
Brown & Connery	20	20	20	35	95
Capehart Scatchard	20	20	20	39	99
Eric M. Bernstein & Associates	10	10	20	10	50
Florio Kenny Raval	10	10	20	20	60
Florio Perrucci Steinhardt & Fader	18	9	20	25	69
Kent McBride	19	20	20	30	89
Leitner Tort DeFazio & Brause	17	12	20	30	79
Scarinci Hollenbeck	14	15	14	35	78
Stahl & DeLaurentis	10	Ŋ	20	10	45
Stephen E. Gertler	16	12	20	25	73

NJSIG RFQ Evaluation

Evaluation Completed by: Shaw ES